PROCEEDINGS OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP

“Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality”

COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE
October 2014
PROCEEDINGS

OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP

ON

“ENHANCING THE CAPACITY OF TOURISM WORKFORCE IN THE OIC MEMBER COUNTRIES FOR IMPROVED TOURISM SERVICE QUALITY”

(September 4th, 2014, Ankara, Turkey)

COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE

October 2014
For further information please contact:

Ms. Aylin SENOL GUN 
Expert

Mr. Mustafa Adil SAYAR 
Expert

COMCEC Coordination Office 
Necatibey Caddesi No: 110/A 
06100 Yüçetepe 
Ankara/TURKEY 
Phone : 90 312 294 57 10 
Fax : 90 312 294 57 77 
Web : www.comcec.org 
e-mail : comcec@comcec.org 
asenol@comcec.org 
msayar@comcec.org
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction................................................................................................................................................. 1

1. Opening Session....................................................................................................................................... 2

2. The COMCEC Tourism Outlook 2014 ..................................................................................................... 3

3. Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce: Global Trends, Approaches and Success Factors ...................................................................................................................................................... 5

4. Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries: Current Situation, Main Challenges, Recommendations and Prospects ........................................................................................................................................... 7

5. Success Stories of the Member States..................................................................................................... 12
   5.1. Egypt .............................................................................................................................................. 12
   5.2. Iran ............................................................................................................................................... 13
   5.3. Iraq ............................................................................................................................................... 13
   5.4. Malaysia .................................................................................................................................... 14
   5.5. Mozambique ............................................................................................................................... 15
   5.6. Oman .......................................................................................................................................... 15
   5.7. Saudi Arabia ............................................................................................................................... 16
   5.8. Turkey ......................................................................................................................................... 17

6. The Way Forward: Policy Options for Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce ................................................................. 19

7. The Way Forward: Utilizing the New COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism ........................................... 21

8. Closing Remarks .................................................................................................................................. 22

Annex 1: Agenda of the Meeting .............................................................................................................. 23

Annex 2: Program of the Meeting ............................................................................................................. 24

Annex 3: The Policy Recommendations .................................................................................................. 27

Annex 4: List of Participants ..................................................................................................................... 29
Introduction

The 4th Meeting of the COMCEC Tourism Working Group was held on September 4th, 2014 in Ankara, Turkey with the theme of “Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality.”

The Meeting was attended by the representatives of 14 Member States, which have notified their focal points for the Tourism Working Group namely, Egypt, Indonesia, Iran, Iraq, Kuwait, Libya, Malaysia, Mozambique, Niger, Oman, Palestine, Saudi Arabia, Senegal and Turkey. Representatives of COMCEC Coordination Office (CCO), SESRIC, Islamic Center for Development of Trade (ICDT) and World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC) as well as representatives from private sector and some other guests have also attended the Meeting.1

At the outset, the representative of the COMCEC Coordination Office presented the revised edition of the “COMCEC Tourism Outlook 2014.” The participants were informed of the major issues regarding tourism sector development in the light of international tourism trends and insights on the current state of tourism in the member countries.

The participants considered the tourism workforce capacity in the Member States through focusing on the Analytical Study titled “Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality” commissioned by the COMCEC Coordination Office specifically for the Meeting with a view to enriching the discussions.

The Representatives of the Member States have shared their experiences, achievements and challenges regarding tourism workforce capacity in their respective countries. The perspective of the private sector on tourism human resource development was also reflected to the discussions. The participants had the chance to discuss the policy options for enhancing the cooperation in this important field. The Analytical Study submitted to the Tourism Working Group Meeting, the answers of the Member Countries to the policy questions as well as the capacity inventory questionnaire sent to the Member States by the COMCEC Coordination Office were the main inputs for the discussions.

Lastly, the COMCEC Coordination Office presented the COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism, introduced by the COMCEC Strategy, and informed the participants of its details.

---

1 The list of participants is attached as Annex 4.
1. Opening Session

In line with the tradition of the Organization of the Islamic Cooperation (OIC), the Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. At the outset, Mr. M. Metin EKER, Director General of the COMCEC Coordination Office briefed the participants on the COMCEC and its activities.

Mr. EKER stated that COMCEC cooperation activities had a new start with the adoption of the COMCEC Strategy in 2012. Implementation of COMCEC Strategy began in 2013. With the Strategy, COMCEC has a new mission: COMCEC aims to become a platform for producing and disseminating knowledge as well as sharing experiences and approximating policies among the Member Countries. The Working Group Mechanism is one of the main instruments introduced by the COMCEC Strategy. Mr. EKER stressed that the Working Group Meetings, which are held twice a year in Ankara in each cooperation area, bring the qualified experts of the Member Countries together to produce knowledge, share experience and best practices and develop a common understanding in the respective cooperation areas. During the previous Tourism Working Group Meetings, crucial issues such as community based tourism, tourism product development and marketing strategies and enabling tourism investment climate in the Member Countries have been considered.

Mr. EKER highlighted that the second operational instrument initiated by the COMCEC Strategy is the Project Cycle Management (PCM) through which the Member States can propose multilateral projects in the cooperation areas defined by the Strategy. Mr. EKER pointed out that this mechanism will give a momentum to Member States’ participation in the cooperation efforts. Mr. EKER underlined that the call for project proposals has been made last year and a considerable number of projects were submitted by 23 Member States as well as the relevant OIC Institutions in six different sectors. Mr. EKER expressed that in April 2014, the implementation phase of the projects has started and the these projects will be completed in December 2014. Mr. EKER also stated that 2nd Project Call has started on September 1st, 2014.

Lastly, underlining the importance of tourism sector for the Member Countries, Mr. EKER expressed his wishes for successful deliberations.

Mr. Ramazan Bahadır ÇOKÇEVİK, Deputy Director General, General Directorate of Promotion of the Ministry of Tourism and Culture of the Republic of Turkey was elected as the Chairman of the Meeting. Mr. ÇOKÇEVİK welcomed the all participants to the 4th Meeting of the Tourism Working Group and expressed his thanks for electing him as the Chairman.
2. The COMCEC Tourism Outlook 2014

Ms. Aslı TAŞMAZ DADAKOĞLU, Expert from the COMCEC Coordination Office, has presented some of the key developments of tourism sector in the world and in the OIC Member Countries. In her presentation, Ms. DADAKOĞLU focused on the importance of tourism sector for development and provided an overview of tourism sector in the world and in the Member Countries.

With regards to tourism, she stated that tourism has experienced continued expansion and diversification, and become one of the most rapidly developing industries in the world. In her presentation, she shared some figures developed by UNWTO to reveal that a strong tourism sector could contribute in many ways to development and the economy. She also mentioned about the new tourism trends like sustainability, changing consumers, technology and stated that the weight of emerging economies in the international tourism market is increasing. She drew attention to these trends which would lead to increases in the competition between countries.

Ms. DADAKOĞLU also shared some figures regarding tourist arrivals and tourism receipts in the world. She said that international tourist arrivals increased from 678 to 1.087 million in the period of 2000-2013. She also shared expectations about the continued growth in the international tourism. It is expressed that the growth of international tourist arrivals and tourism receipts in emerging economies are greater than advanced economies for the years 2000-2012 and there is a tendency of increase in Asia-Pacific Region and decrease in Europe and America.

Furthermore, Ms. DADAKOĞLU elaborated on the tourism sector in the Member States. Regarding to tourist arrivals, the Member States performed above the world averages for the period 2005-2012. She presented that the Member Countries constituted 14-17% of international tourist arrivals and 12-14 % of tourism receipts in the period 2005-2011. It was highlighted that there was a tendency to increase in the share of Member Countries in both tourist arrivals and tourism receipts.

It was also stated that Turkey and Malaysia were ranked 6th and 10th, respectively among the top 10 world tourist destinations. Regarding the tourism receipts, she demonstrated that tourism receipts were concentrated in a few member countries. Ms. DADAKOĞLU also shared some figures on travel balance in some member countries. She stated that some member countries have a tendency to spend more than their tourism receipts like Saudi Arabia, United Arab Emirates, Iran and Qatar. She also emphasized that some countries have surplus on the travel balances. In her presentation, intra-OIC tourism results were given in the Member States. Within the sub-groups of the OIC, with regards to the tourist arrivals, OIC-MENA can be seen as the best performing OIC sub-region. Similarly, tourism receipts of the OIC-MENA exceeded the OIC Asia sub-region.

In her presentation, Ms. DADAKOĞLU provided a brief account of the recent developments in the Member Countries. She stated that some of the member countries like Turkey (5%), Malaysia (10%), Indonesia (10%), Jordon (3%), and Morocco (9%) enjoyed high growth rates in their tourist arrivals for the first months of 2014.
Despite some developments in the OIC Member Countries, some other major destinations faced declines in the first half of the year 2014.

Underlining the great potential in tourism sector among the Member States, Ms. DADAKOĞLU mentioned the following challenges affecting tourism performance in the OIC Member Countries:

- Insufficient Tourism Investments and Infrastructures
- Poor Tourism Planning & Product Development
- Travel Facilitation Problems
- Safety and Security Related Problems
- Low Tourism Service Quality
- Insufficient Marketing and Promotion
- Insufficient Image Building and Branding

She concluded her presentation by stating that the only key to the success lies in adding quality to the tourism products through quality services which can be provided through education and training.
3. Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce: Global Trends, Approaches and Success Factors

Prof. Dr. Thomas BAUM, Head of Department from University of Strathclyde made a presentation on “Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce: Global Trends, Approaches and Success Factors”.

Mr. BAUM started his presentation by expressing the importance of human capital for the tourism sector. Mr. BAUM pointed out that investment in human resource development in the tourism sector is very crucial for the success and profitability of the sector. There is global recognition that the quality of tourism employees is critical for competitiveness for both enterprises and destinations and high quality employees make a real difference in the sector. Destinations that invest strategically in their tourism workforce such as Ireland, Singapore and Malaysia were highlighted.

Mr. BAUM also gave examples of companies that recognize the value of investment in tourism workforce such as Marriott/ Ritz-Carlton and Southwest Airlines. Achieving success with a focus on employee quality requires an integrated approach to human resource management, recognizing that all dimensions are equally important in achieving this. These dimensions include effective recruitment, training, career development, rewards and benefits and, finally, the application of an effective general style of management. Institutional and programme arrangements which effectively support multi-level, effective and sustainable vocational and professional training for and within the industry are vital for the sound tourism system.

He also informed the participants of the Tourism Service Profit Chain (TSPC). With the TSPC, Mr. BAUM demonstrated the clear link between a committed and engaged workforce, investment in the skills of that workforce and the delivery of high quality tourism experiences. This would lead to increased visitor satisfaction and increased visitor spending, repeated visits to the destination or enterprise and, finally, business profitability. In adopting the TSPC, there is also a need to recognize the changing context of work and employees within the tourism industry. In this regard, Mr. BAUM highlighted the impact of new occupational profiles, skills requirements and skills gaps; the changing profile of the tourism employee; and the application of effective human resource development practices.

Finally, Mr. BAUM highlighted the importance of a partnership approach to addressing human resource development challenges in tourism and identifying the complementary roles of key stakeholders in this partnership:

- Government and related public agencies;
- Educational and training providers, both public and private;
- Private sector enterprises and the professional associations which represent hotels, travel agents, chefs, tour guides etc;
- Current employees within the hospitality and tourism industry;
- Local community interests and the students and families who participate in the training; and
• International bodies which may include Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), and donor agencies.

Questions and Remarks

Comment and Question: Although the private sector recognized the importance of investment in human resource development, private sector considered it as the responsibility of public sector, not the private sector. Since private sector avoids investing in human resource development, how can the responsibility between public and private sector be shared?

Answer: Investment in human resource development is similar to investment in hotel facilities with a view to improving the capacity of a tourism business. Therefore, private sector should be aware of its importance. However, public sector has an initial role for enhancing human resource capacity in schools, colleagues and universities. The problem in many member countries is that private sector has small businesses in tourism sector which needs support from the government.

Question: Regional standards for workforce development with particular reference to ASEAN were mentioned in the presentation. You expressed that you have some concerns regarding the regional standards in workforce development. In this respect, what was the motive behind the regional standards in this regard and why do you see these standards as a concern?

Answer:

Mr. Baum: Actually, we have no concern about regional standards in principle. However, tourism industry and training system are so diverse across the countries. For example, a standard for a less developed country cannot be applicable for a country like Malaysia, in which tourism sector is well-developed. In theory, these standards may facilitate tourism workforce development, but in practice, more developed countries may be reluctant to accept these standards as they apply their own standards.

Malaysia: We have developed the tourism workforce standards which we called MRE (Asian Mutual Recognition for Tourism Professionals). One of the objectives of these standards is to enhance the mobility of tourism professionals among Asian countries and to exchange information and best practices in the competency based education and training for tourism human resource as well as to provide opportunity for capacity building across ASEAN Member Countries.

Comment: Training is one of the most crucial mechanisms for workforce development in tourism sector. As Member Countries, we can develop joint training programmes in order to share and exchange our experiences.
4. Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries: Current Situation, Main Challenges, Recommendations and Prospects

4.1. Government Policies and Programmes for Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries

In his second presentation, Mr. BAUM focused on tourism human resource development in the member countries. He highlighted the diverse tourism industries and varied levels of investment in human resource development across the 57 member countries. He also noted that direct employment in tourism in the Member Countries totaled over 14.3 million in 2013, an increase of 27.68% from 11.2 million employees in 2001. While there are examples of excellence in some countries, highlighting best practice across a range of key human resource development (HRD) indicators, there is also rather more widespread evidence of immature, emerging HRD systems for tourism, where there is a major requirement for change.

Mr. BAUM gave information on the leadership role for governments in Human Capital Development:

- Develop or strengthen HR policies, plans and actions, in the context of overall tourism policies, strategies and plans
- Encourage private sector trade bodies to address Human Capital issues, including agreeing on employment standards
- Encourage the formation of responsible bodies to represent the needs of employees in the tourism sector
- Ensure that social dialogue is pursued as a continuous process
- Consider using incentives to stimulate tourism employment

Mr. BAUM also gave brief information on the integrated role for government other than leadership. He emphasized the importance of coordination not only within the government, between the responsible ministries and institutions, but also between government, private sector and non-governmental organizations. Publicizing and promoting are also crucial for overcoming the negative perceptions on the tourism industry in many countries. Governments should also provide recognitions, certification and awards for encouraging human resource development in the tourism sector.

Furthermore, Mr. BAUM presented the main challenges faced by the member countries in enhancing human resource capacity as follows:

- Lack of long term national human resource development strategy
- Absence of stakeholder partnerships in workforce skills development for tourism
- Limited private sector industry involvement in decision-making about training and up-skilling and ineffective consultative arrangements
- Low status of tourism professions in the eyes of many potential entrants and their families
- Skills shortages in key tourism professions
- Supplier dominated training system with limited focus on workplace skills needs
- Limited confidence and understanding by employers and employees in the workforce development system

Finally, Mr. BAUM highlighted the main recommendations as follows:

Inform - Information sharing will play a vital role in addressing labor force pressures in the tourism and hospitality industry of each Member Countries. The Inform theme focuses on increased access to information to support informed decision-making on the part of employers, workers, youth entering the workforce and individuals considering employment in this industry.

Engage - At the heart of a realistic solution to the HRD challenge in tourism is the engagement of all stakeholders in a partnership model for skills enhancement which will necessitate close cooperation with the delegation of responsibilities to local government, civil societies, industry associations and private sector operators. This output is crucial in seeking a sustainable up-skilling model for the Member Countries.

Attract - The Attract theme relates to attracting workers from inside and outside the OIC Member Countries to meet some of the demand for labor in the countries’ tourism and hospitality industry.

Develop - The Develop theme focuses on building the tourism and hospitality workforce in the Member Countries through education and training.

Retain - The Retain theme relates to enhancing the attractiveness of working in the tourism and hospitality industry so that workers stay in the industry.

Coordinate, Communicate, Co-operate, and Collaborate - There is wide disparity in training standards in the OIC Member Countries and very few best-practice training models. On the other hand, world-class tourism training expertise exists in the Member Countries, as does quality private sector operations. The best approach to upgrading standards will be through processes designed to share experience.

Questions and Remarks

Question: As you know, most of the countries have some programmes and strategies for human resource development in tourism sector. Do you think, as the Member Countries, we should have a unified programme or a strategy in order to standardize the level of tourism workforce development?

Answer: You are right; some Member Countries have this kind of programmes and strategies. However, in the world, the developed countries in tourism sector are preparing their programmes according to their own needs rather than developing a unified programme or a strategy. Therefore, these programmes are changeable and need to be designed according to the peculiarities of each country such as education, tourism and tourism marketing system.
4.2. Private Sector Perspective for Human Resource Capacity Development

A- World Travel and Tourism Council

Ms. Rochelle TURNER from the World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC) made a presentation titled "Understanding Future Talent Gaps for Travel & Tourism." She first gave information about her organization. She expressed that mission of World Travel & Tourism Council is "To maximize the sustainable growth of the industry by informing governments and wider society of the enormous economic and social benefit that Travel & Tourism brings to the world community".

Ms. TURNER shared some numbers regarding global tourism. She stated that the sector contributes to global economy financially up to 7 trillion USD while creating 266 million job opportunities. She added that overall tourism sector constitutes 9.5% of global GDP. She argued that financial contribution would increase 11 trillion USD by 2024.

Ms. TURNER shared a figure exhibiting ratio of tourism employment as well as contribution of the sector to the economy for the top ten OIC Member Countries. She told that the figures varied greatly from country to country. She stated that contribution of the sector to the national economies will increase from 2013 to 2024 similarly to global forecasts however with lower growth rate.

In later part of her presentation, Ms. TURNER dwelled upon some of the problems of the sector. She argued that supply of qualified human resource is below to match global demand. She expressed that one issue is lack of awareness among young undergraduates regarding employment opportunities and potential of the sector. Secondly she said that a similar lack of perspectives exist among policy makers as well. On the other hand, she told that ratio of young employees in the tourism sector is relatively high in some countries such as Germany and Turkey. She exemplified that proportion of the young Turkish workforce is approximately 7% higher than the overall young employment average. Ms. TURNER pointed out that growth of tourism sector also impacts on employment in other sectors foremost infrastructure since new hotels and facilities will be required in upcoming term.

Ms. TURNER gave brief information regarding one of the Research Studies they conducted in their member countries on human resource issues. She stated that recruiting has always been a problem for countries but based on preliminary data they found out that two third of countries expressed recruitment issue will be much harder in next five years. She also pointed out that lack of talent balance puts pressure on already employed workforce. She stated that employees in the industry will do more work or be asked to do tasks that they are not qualified and thus, morale of the employees could significantly be lower in upcoming years. Ms. TURNER expressed that deficit for skillful employees for the tourism sector is much higher than the need for overall economies in most countries.

Ms. TURNER concluded her presentation by showing results WTTC’s Study. She stated that future talent supply falls short of talent demand. She argued that in such instance;
- Labor shortages will lead to below-potential growth and foregone investment
- Skill shortages will lead to higher wage costs and erode competitiveness
- Skill gaps may lead to inferior customer service and reduced standards

B- Rixos Hotels

Mr. Hüseyin KÜCÜ, Human Resource Manager of Rixos Hotel in Antalya, Turkey made a presentation titled “Talent Development & Hospitality Industry”.

Mr. KÜCÜ firstly gave some information about Rixos Hotels. In rest of his presentation, he focused on the Rixos Talent Development Processes as a success story.

Mr. KÜCÜ stated that training and development is not a one-time event in Rixos but rather an ongoing part of employee’s life. He added that they both aim to maximize the talent of their employees and ensure their career successes. He expressed that Rixos Academy, which is in charge of training and development process, coordinates activities in three main areas namely; The Legal Trainings, Department Trainings and Personal Development & Leadership Trainings.

Mr. KÜCÜ firstly informed participants regarding training processes. He stated that top university graduates have been selected as Management Trainees and were given basic trainings in the first phase. These employees then work in various parts of the hotel. He expressed that after two to three years, these Management Trainees are placed in specific departments as managers based on their interest and competencies.

While briefing the participants about the types of training programs, Mr. KÜCÜ expressed that “mentor” system which is a formal relationship between trainees with leadership potential and senior managers at executive level, is used to transfer corporate culture, leadership and experiences to management trainees.

Mr. KÜCÜ gave the details of another training program called “Rotation Management”. He expressed that employees were given the chance to work at the Rixos Hotels in other countries to learn about Rixos Culture in a different context. Mr. KÜCÜ finally introduced “USTA” program in which experienced employees give on-the-job training to the new employees for at approximately four weeks.

In later part of his presentation Mr. KÜCÜ dwelled upon performance development program within the Rixos Group. He stated that every employee is evaluated based on key competencies such as teamwork, ownership, customer orientation, persuasion with a view to maximize employees’ performance in the company. He expressed that they positioned employees according to their competency results. He also added while low performers attend to training programs, high performers are selected to development programs such as Management Trainee Program.

Mr. KÜCÜ concluded his presentation by sharing information about activities of the Rixos Academy in Baku including key aspects of training and comments of the trainees.
Questions and Remarks

**Question:** What are the main challenges that the Rixos Hotels experienced in enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce, particularly in the OIC Member Countries?

**Answer:** Mr. KÜCÜ stated that necessary preparations for each operations as well as negotiations with host governments indeed take long periods and require much effort. Mr. KÜCÜ also mentioned that one of the main challenges is to adapt to environment of a new facility/hotel. He expressed that political environment, work permits, visa processes and local law may pose challenges.
5. Success Stories of the Member States

5.1. Egypt:

Ms. Hagar SOLIMAN, Technical Member in International Relation Department of Ministry of Tourism (MOT), made a presentation regarding Egypt’s experience in developing human resources in tourism sector. Ms. SOLIMAN underlined that Egypt is considered as one of the top leading tourism destinations not only in the Middle East but also in Africa. She continued her presentation by sharing some statistics about tourism of her country. She expressed that tourism industry is the principal generator of income and foreign exchange earnings. Tourism constituted directly and indirectly 11.3% of GDP in 2013. Ms. SOLIMAN highlighted that, as a labor-intensive industry due to its direct and indirect connections with other sectors (around 70 sectors), tourism sector is considered as main provider of employment, which is about 12.6% of the total employed population.

Ms. SOLIMAN briefed the participants on plans/programs for improving quality of services in Egypt. The following areas were highlighted in this respect:

- Skill Developing Programs
- Apprenticeship Training
- On the job Training

Ms. SOLIMAN underlined the importance of the training regarding the improving the quality of services and informed the participants that MOT puts a comprehensive plan through five approaches given below and gave some specific examples under these approaches.

- Enhancing Language Skills
- Developing Information Technology and Computer Skills: Program of solving problem of decision making through computer
- Improving the Technical Skills in Tourism Management: Scholarship of obtaining master’s degree in cultural heritage management
- Exchanging Experiences in Tourism Field: training to 19 experts from commonwealth in e-marketing of tourist destinations and Egypt experience
- Encouraging the Tourist Research Studies: by the employees and supporting researchers in tourism studies from other institutions

Furthermore, Ms. SOLIMAN stated that in cooperation with other public entities, MOT established a series of training programs to improve the services in tourism sector. Lastly, she informed the participants that these training programs are organized in accordance with the following three main approaches:

1. Developing educational system in tourism and hospitality institutions.
2. Training fresh graduates of tourism institutions.
3. Developing skills of tourism sector employees and upgrading their professional levels.
5.2. Iran:

Ms. Farah Valinejad ARDEHAEI, Expert from the Iranian Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization (ICHTO) presented her country’s experience in enhancing capacity of tourism workforce. At the outset, Ms. ARDEHAEI expressed that the main objective of tourism industry is serving customers and making profits. She underlined that the good performance in tourism industry is based on good management, skilled workforce and adaptability to change. She continued her presentation by identifying the meaning of the workforce development. She argued that “improving business competition and increasing the quality of products” are the goal of workforce development. She expressed that workforce profile consists of accommodation, tourism and travel, transport, food and beverage, events and the others. She stressed that workforce in tourism industry needs special training programmes. The following issues need to be considered in this respect:

- Training workforce & placing right people in right jobs
- Promote creative thinking & problem solving
- Increasing productivity of people
- Enhancing motivation

Ms. ARDEHAEI concluded her presentation by demonstrating a video record on Iran in tourism sector.

5.3. Iraq:

Mr. Talib TUAMA, interpreter from the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities of Iraq shared his country's experience in the workforce development in the tourism sector. Mr. TUAMA gave a brief information on the profile of tourism sector in Iraq and the organizational structure of the Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities, which was established in 2003.

Mr. TUAMA also informed the participants on the development of human resource capacity of tourism workforce in Iraq. He stated that tourism sector needs active and skillful workers in order to develop better tourism services. For this reason, the attention should be focused on education and training of tourism workforce.

Therefore, Iraqi government recognized the need of qualified tourism staff for the development of tourism sector and established tourism institutions. The goal of these institutions are preparing professional staff for all levels and providing qualified staff having relevant. Mr. TUAMA also mentioned some challenges Iraq confronted:

- Absence of educational programs that suit the needs of tourism market,
- Lack of trained working staff and deficiency of competition among tourism staff,
- Absence of tourism planning.

Lastly, Mr. TUAMA provided some suggestions for tourism workforce development in the Member Countries. He highlighted the importance of setting up the training courses and organizing workshops for administrative and technical employees and establishing a tourism training center in the Member Countries for training tourism staff.
5.4. Malaysia:

Mr. Saad KHAIROLNIZAM, Principal Assistant Secretary from the Ministry of Tourism of Malaysia, started his presentation by giving the outline of his presentation consisting of three sections namely; Overview of Tourism and Hospitality, Current skill standards and National Certification System and Programmes and activities. Mr. KHAIROLNIZAM mentioned that, according the Central Bank Statistics, the Tourism sector is the second source of the foreign earnings in Malaysia. In 2013 tourism sector generated 20.64 billion USD. Mr. KHAIROLNIZAM stated that Malaysia was 11th country in the world rank of international tourist arrivals and 13th country in the world rank of international tourism receipts in 2013.

Mr. KHAIROLNIZAM also mentioned that tourism receipts in 2013 were 21 billion USD and international arrivals were 27.7 million. He stressed that the target of tourism receipts and international arrivals are 23.9 billion USD and 28 million respectively for the year 2014. He stated that, according to Malaysia Tourism Transformation Plan introduced in 2009, the targeted number of tourist arrivals is expected to be 36 million and the targeted tourism receipts is planned to be 51.38 billion USD by 2020. He informed the participants that this year Malaysia is organizing the Visit Malaysia 2014 year and to keep up this momentum they will introduce the new campaign “Year of Festivals 2015”. He also informed the participants regarding the Strategy of MyFest 2015.

At this stage, Mr. Muhamad FADHLI, Principal Assistant Secretary from the Ministry of Tourism of Malaysia continued the presentation by touching upon human resource and carrier development in Malaysia. He mentioned that the major percentage of employment in tourism was in Food and Beverage (37.8%) and the lowest one was in travel agencies (2.1%). He expressed that in Malaysia, the following programs were conducted for enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce:

- We Are The Host and Malaysia Welcomes the World Courses (MWW)
- Spa Therapist Training Programme
- Homestay Operator Training
- Tourist Guide Course (City / Nature / Heritage / Regional Specific)

Mr. FADHLI shared some of Malaysian experience regarding human capacity building and establishing certain standards to increase skills, knowledge and attitude of the employees in tourism sector. Mr. FADHLI underlined that the most important thing in the beginning was to set up the National Tourism Human Resource Development Council (NTHRDC) which consists of different ministries, agencies as well as industry players and NGOs related to Tourism. He informed the participants that under the NTHRDC, three working groups were established namely, TWG on Tourism Career Development, TWG on Tourism Labor Market and Training Need Analysis and TWG on Quality Tourism Workforce.

Mr. FADHLI concluded his presentation by giving some information regarding one of the standards developed in Malaysia called National Occupational Skill Standard (NOSS). NOSS is a document that outlines the dexterity required of an employee working in Malaysia at a certain level of employment to achieve specific skills. He emphasized that standards are critical to improve workforce skills and competitiveness of Malaysian economy. Mr. FADHLI concluded
his presentation by informing participants about the programmes and activities conducted in Malaysia.

5.5. Mozambique:

At the outset, Mr. Jose FARIA, Head of Department from the Ministry of Tourism of Mozambique, informed the participants that Mozambique conducted the Human Resources Development Strategy during the period of 2006 and 2013. Mr. FARIA stated that the New Strategic Plan identified three basic requirements:

- Qualified, motivated, skilled labor force in tourism sector
- Development of skill, competitiveness and motivated public sector
- Create right environment and assistance to develop tourism industry

Afterwards, Mr. Zacarias SUMBANA, the Coordinator from Ministry of Tourism of Mozambique, continued the presentation. He informed the participants that the number of tourism workforce in public sector is 1,339 while total work force included private sector is about 5,000. He also informed the participants about organizational structure of public sector at ministerial and provincial level. Regarding the prospects and challenges, Mr. SUMBANA underlined the importance of developing strategic partnerships with regional and international institutions and organizations for the training of tourism professionals at all levels and developing programs to increase the involvement of women in the tourism sector in order to promote gender equality. He mentioned that Ministry of Tourism was established in 2000 and tourism is in its early stage in Mozambique. He stressed the importance of the international cooperation to train people in Mozambique.

5.6. Oman:

Ms. Amina Andullah Al BALUSHI, Director of Statistics and Geographical Information Department of the Ministry of Tourism of Sultanate of Oman, made a presentation on tourism workforce capacity in her country. Ms. Al BALUSHI expressed that there are 5 strategic tourism targets in Vision 2020 which is a vision for economic development in Oman. These strategic targets are as follows:

- Make Oman one of the main tourism destinations in the region
- Increase tourism contribution to 3% of the national GDP
- Strengthen the partnership between the government sector and the private sector
- Encourage tourism enterprises to develop more tourism projects
- Increase number of national employment in tourism targeting around 80% Omanization in the industry

Ms. Al BALUSHI continued her presentation by giving some economic figures that show the increase in tourism development. She informed the participants that the total Omani employee percentage in tourism sector was 39.6% in 2013. She also informed the participants that in accommodation and tourism agencies, the number of expatriate employee is bigger than the Omani employee. She argued that the followings are the main human resources challenges in tourism sector in Oman:
• Image of Tourism Sector Employment
• Omanization percentage needs revision
• Lack of interest to join the hospitality sector
• Low Salaries in Tourism industry
• Tourism Education and Training Provision
• Closing of Skill Gaps
• Tour Guide Licensing and Training
• Turnover of local work force

She concluded her presentation by giving strategic objectives and possible solutions to overcome these challenges in Oman’s tourism sector:

• Establish new coordination mechanisms to strengthen planning, monitoring and partnership for national level human resource development policy in tourism sector
• Strengthen Omanization policy implementation
• Enhance public awareness of tourism and improve the image of tourism as an employer and industry
• Strengthen tourism education/job training and student employment
• Monitoring and evaluation of action plan implementation

5.7. Saudi Arabia:

Dr. Salah K. ALBUKHAYET, Vice President and General Supervisor of the Initiative Tourism and Investment Development of Saudi Commission for Tourism and Antiques (SCTA), made a presentation on the initiatives for the localization of tourism jobs in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia.

Dr. ALBUKHAYET informed the participants of the tourism career opportunities in his country and the SCTA’s efforts to develop tourism human resources. He expressed that SCTA established the National Tourism Human Resources Development Center (Takamul) in 2004 for the purpose of localization of tourism jobs and support the programs for career awareness. He also presented some accomplishments of Takamul and shared some statistics on tourism jobs. He stated that in 2013, Saudization percentage of the total jobs in tourism sector was approximately 27%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Saudis</td>
<td>128,605</td>
<td>118,072</td>
<td>189,490</td>
<td>203,202</td>
<td>217,906</td>
<td>233,674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Saudis</td>
<td>500,705</td>
<td>511,274</td>
<td>519,802</td>
<td>547,654</td>
<td>576,951</td>
<td>607,761</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Jobs</td>
<td>629,310</td>
<td>629,346</td>
<td>709,292</td>
<td>750,856</td>
<td>794,856</td>
<td>841,435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saudization Percentage (%)</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>27.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Furthermore, Dr. ALBUKHAYET stated that SCTA has supported the establishment of more than 25 training centers, institutions, and colleges with the cooperation of its partners in
government and private sector. He expressed that, annually, 11,500 student and trainee graduated from these 25 facilities.

Lastly, Dr. ALBUKHAYET mentioned some of the challenges faced by his country regarding tourism human resource development. These challenges are:

- Lack of professional training facilities specialized in tourism training to meet the demand of job opportunities.
- Lack of specialized professional trainers in tourism fields
- High percentage of drop-out rate of students in training programs (35-45%)
- The need of awareness-raising campaign of the importance of tourism professions and its promising future.

5.8. Turkey:

Mr. Mert KABASAKAL, Assistant Expert from Ministry of Culture and Tourism made a presentation on training in tourism sector in Turkey.

Mr. KABASAKAL stated that tourism trainings in Turkey can be divided in two groups, formal and non-formal tourism trainings. He briefly informed the participants regarding the three programs conducted under the Formal Tourism Education, namely Associate Degree Programs, Undergraduate Programs and Graduate Programs. He expressed that the aims of Associate Degree Programs are Training of Mid-level Managers, Training of Management Trainee and Training of Qualified Personnel. He stated that the number of associate degree level high school number is 151 in Turkey. He stressed that there are 55 undergraduate programs aiming to train top-level management. Mr. KABASAKAL informed the participants that the aim of Graduate programs is training of top-level managers, trainers, consultants and researchers for tourism business. He also informed the participants regarding the fields of Anatolian Hotel and Tourism Vocational High Schools. He expressed that there is an annual student quota for Undergraduate Degree Programs (6,702), Associate Degree Programs (13,859) and Tourism Vocational High Schools (36,256). He also shared the number of insured tourism employees in the year 2012 and 2013.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THE NUMBER OF INSURED TOURISM EMPLOYEES</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>Difference %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food&amp;Beverage</td>
<td>394,806</td>
<td>457,999</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td>222,809</td>
<td>257,979</td>
<td>15.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sport, Entertainment,etc.</td>
<td>45,092</td>
<td>53,828</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour Operator &amp; Travel Agency Services</td>
<td>46,210</td>
<td>49,998</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Airline</td>
<td>6,723</td>
<td>18,395</td>
<td>173.6*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in Tourism</td>
<td>715,640</td>
<td>838,199</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total in Turkey</td>
<td>11,521,869</td>
<td>12,262,422</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country Share %</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Republic of Turkey Social Security Institution(SGK)/April 2012-2013/
*High growth rates due to the increase in the number of companies covered by 4 A
He stressed the gap between the number of students trained at formal tourism training and the number of insured tourism employees. He expressed that this gap is closed by non-formal tourism training. He mentioned that non-formal tourism trainings are provided mainly by Ministry of National Education and Ministry of Culture and Tourism. He informed the participants that 1,300 person are being trained by 11 Tourism Training Centers (Turem) which are affiliated to the Ministry of National Education. He stated that Ministry of Culture and Tourism conducted two types of non-formal tourism trainings; International Training Activities and Non-formal Tourism Training Programs. These 2 programs have also 4 sub-components:

- On the Job Training Courses
- Hotel Management and Travel Agency Training Programs
- Training of Trainers Courses
- Self-Development Training Seminars

Lastly, he informed the participants that the Authority of Vocational Qualifications was established in 2006 to generate "National Professional Standards" which sets the minimum standards in order to perform a job successfully. In coordination with the relevant NGOs, Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, which was authorized by the Authority of Vocational Qualifications, determined 23 professions for tourism sector.
6. The Way Forward: Policy Options for Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce

The session was moderated by Mr. Fatih ÜNLÜ, Senior Expert from the COMCEC Coordination Office. At the outset, Mr. ÜNLÜ said that one major component of the COMCEC’s mission is to approximate the policies of the member countries for a more prosperous Islamic Ummah. Before opening the discussion, he underlined that policy issues usually entail broad subjects therefore they bring and lead to macro results. For that reason, we cannot use trial and error method for finding the best policy options as that may lead to failures and considerable losses, more importantly loss of confidence which is a critical requirement for success. We have to use various methods including research, consultation, brainstorming, simulation, cooperation and sharing experiences for reaching to the best policy set for the issue at hand. This session is organized for that purpose, i.e. for sharing policy experiences in workforce development in the tourism sector.

He indicated that CCO has prepared a questionnaire which was replied by some member countries. As these replies can be basis for a more focused discussion, he first gave the floor to CCO representative to summarize their evaluation of the replies.

Ms. Aslı TAŞMAZ DADAKOĞLU said that 5 specific questions were prepared by CCO related to the policies of member countries for Tourism Workforce development. The purpose was to strengthen policy dimension in the discussions of the Working Groups. From the countries registered for Tourism Working Group, 8 countries have replied the questionnaire.

Questions contained in the questionnaire were as follows:

1. Does your country have a long term national tourism human resource development strategy?
2. Are there any private sector initiatives to support tourism workforce capacity in your country?
3. Does your country have a special budget for training of existing tourism personnel?
4. Does your country have national occupational standards or accreditation in tourism services?
5. What kind of education and training policies and programs would you recommend to increase the quality of tourism workforce? Please provide concrete examples.

From the replies, a number of issues emerged as follows:

In addition to the strong need for financing the HRD activities in the tourism sector, having a sound strategy for Tourism Workforce Development and its efficient implementation and occupational standards were highlighted in the replies. Various countries have indicated the areas where they need capacity building while some countries like Iran, Malaysia and Turkey have conveyed that they can offer technical assistance to other countries in various areas.

Mr. ÜNLÜ thanked the representative of CCO for the concise evaluation and mentioned that there are a number of available tools for enhancing policy cooperation among the member
countries in this critical area such as COMCEC Project Cycle Management, COMCEC capacity building activities and SESRIC capacity building programmes in addition to the national resources of the member countries. Therefore, distinguished members of the delegations can be very specific in their proposals and if possible indicate the countries from whose experience they wish to benefit.

Then the Moderator gave the floor to all delegations requesting them to kindly center their interventions on the main issues emerged from the replies, i.e. cooperation in the preparation of Workforce Development Strategy and its implementation and occupational standards and any other issue that they deem very important.

Based on intensive deliberations, CCO drafted attached document\(^2\) reflecting the main points of agreement by the delegations. It was agreed that CCO will circulate this draft document to all members of Tourism Working Group for their views and comments to be conveyed to the CCO by 15th October 2014 at the latest. After incorporating the Member States’ contributions, CCO will submit it to the 30th Session of the COMCEC to be held on 25-28th November, 2014 as an outcome of the 4th TWG Meeting.

The policy advices highlighted by the participants are as follows:

1. The Tourism Working Group underscored the importance of developing *Tourism Workforce Development Strategies* in the Member Countries and supporting the effective implementation of the existing ones.

2. Enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce in the Member Countries

---

\(^2\) The policy recommendations document is attached as Annex 3.
7. The Way Forward: Utilizing the New COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism

Mr. Mustafa TEKİN, Director at the COMCEC Coordination Office made a presentation on the Project Cycle Management (PCM) introduced by the COMCEC Strategy. First, Mr. TEKİN informed the participants about where the PCM stands in the COMCEC Strategy.

Mr. TEKİN briefly explained the PCM concept. After underlining the basic qualifications of the COMCEC PCM as "simple and clearly defined procedures and financial framework", he highlighted the potential project owners. It was emphasized that relevant ministries and other public institutions of the Member Countries and the OIC Institutions operating in the field of economic and commercial cooperation could submit projects.

Mr. TEKİN continued his presentation with the clarification of "Project Selection Criteria" namely, compliance with Strategy's Principles, targeting strategic objectives of the Strategy, focusing on output areas and pursuing multilateral cooperation among the OIC Member Countries. In the following sections, nature of the projects (Technical Cooperation and Capacity Building) and several eligible activities were explained. Eligible activities comprised of research, analytical studies, guides, roadmaps, study visits, conferences, workshops etc.

During the presentation, three key actors and their responsibilities under the PCM were identified; Project Owner (Project Submission and Implementation); the CCO (Program Management) and the Intermediary Bank (Project Monitoring and Financing). Moreover, steps and roles of these key actors throughout the project application process were defined.

Monitoring of projects was another issue explained in the presentation. Mr. TEKİN presented that the Bank would be mainly responsible for financial and technical monitoring of projects while the CCO would oversee the overall implementation of the PCM.

With respect to the financial framework, Mr. TEKİN emphasized that the funds are grant in nature and would be provided by the COMCEC Coordination Office. From the illustration of the indicative grant limits and co-finance rates for the COMCEC projects, it was seen that Member Countries could submit a project with a budget up to USD 250,000 with the condition that they have to cover at least ten percent of project total budget (cash or in kind). This amount would be USD 100,000 for the OIC Institutions and at least twenty five percent should be covered by the project owner.

Mr. TEKİN informed the participants of the results of the first project call. Mr. TEKИН stated that member countries and the OIC Institutions have shown great interest to the first call and implementation period began in early April 2014 and would end by December 2014.

Lastly, Mr. TEKİN briefed the participants on the details of the 2nd project call which was made on September 1st, 2014. He informed the participants of the new edition of the Program Implementation Guideline and sectoral themes stated in the Guidelines. Mr. TEKİN concluded his presentation by giving the timeline for the 2014 project call.
8. Closing Remarks

The Meeting ended with closing remarks of Mr. Ramazan Bahadır ÇOKÇEVİK, Chairman of the Meeting and Mr. Metin EKER, Director General of the COMCEC Coordination Office.

In his remarks, Mr. ÇOKÇEVİK thanked all the participants for giving him the opportunity to moderate the Meeting. He also thanked all the delegates, representatives of private sector and international institutions for their invaluable contributions and the COMCEC Coordination Office for the excellent organization.

Mr. Metin EKER also thanked all the participants for their precious attendance and valuable contributions. He underlined that the observations, comments and critiques of the participants on the documents prepared specifically for the Tourism Working Group Meetings would be mostly welcomed in order to improve their quality. The comments of the participants can be shared in the e-mail group, which is opened for the open discussion among the focal points of the COMCEC Tourism Working Group. The Brainstorming Session in which policy discussion was made was important session. Mr. EKER also highlighted the importance of PCM mechanism, by which Member States are mobilized for the cooperation efforts of the COMCEC. He reminded that the 2nd project call will be made in September 2014 and invited the Member Countries as well as the relevant OIC Institutions to develop their projects.

He also mentioned the inventory study questionnaire, which was circulated to the Member Countries for determining the capacity needs in tourism sector in June 2014. He kindly asked participants to fill out this questionnaire in order to take a record of the profile of the capacity needs and possible contributions of the Member Countries.

Mr. EKER also informed the participants regarding the 30th COMCEC Session to be held on 25-28 November 2014 in Istanbul, in which the main theme of discussions during the Exchange of Views Session of the Ministers will be “The Role of Public-Private Partnerships for the Development of Tourism Sector in the OIC Member Countries”. For this Session a preparatory workshop will be held by COMCEC Coordination Office and SESRIC on 30 September -1 October 2014 in Ankara. He also informed the participants that the next (5th) Meeting of the Tourism Working Group will be held on February 5th, 2015 in Ankara with the theme of Travel Facilitation for Enhancing Mobility in the OIC Member Countries.”

Before concluding, Mr. EKER thanked again all the participants and wished them a safe trip back home.
Annex 1: Agenda of the Meeting

4th MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP
(September 4th, 2014, Ankara)

“Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality”

DRAFT AGENDA

Opening Remarks

1. The COMCEC Tourism Outlook
   a. Overview of International Tourism in the World
   b. International Tourism in the Member Countries
   c. Tourism Opportunities and Challenges in the Member Countries

2. Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce: Global Trends, Approaches and Success Factors
   a. The Importance of Human Capital for Tourism
   b. Factors and Trends for Developing Human Resource Capacity

3. Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries: Current Situation, Main Challenges, Recommendations and Prospects
   a. Government Policies and Programmes for Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries
   b. Private Sector Perspective for Human Resource Capacity-Development

4. Success Stories of the Member States

5. The Way Forward:
   a. Utilizing the COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism
   b. Policy Options for Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce

Closing Remarks

-------

---
Annex 2: Program of the Meeting

DRAFT PROGRAMME
4th MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP
(September 4th, 2014, Ankara, Crowne Plaza Hotel)
“Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality”

08.30-09.00  Registration
09.00-09.15  Opening Remarks
09.15-09.45  The COMCEC Tourism Outlook
              - Presentation: Ms. Ash TAŞMAZ DADAKOĞLU
                Expert
                COMCEC Coordination Office
09.45-10.45  Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce: Global Trends, Approaches and Success Factors
              - Presentation: Prof. Dr. Thomas BAUM
                Tourism Development Partners

          Questions for Discussion
            ✓ How does your country perceive the recent global trends regarding tourism workforce capacity?

10.45-11.00  Coffee Break
11.00-11.45  Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries: Current Situation, Main Challenges, Recommendations and Prospects
              - Government Policies and Programmes for Tourism Workforce Development in the Member Countries
                - Presentation: Prof. Dr. Thomas BAUM
                  Tourism Development Partners
Questions for Discussion

✓ Does your country have any “unique” experience which you can highlight and recommend the other participants to pay special attention for tourism workforce development?
✓ How can we raise awareness on the human resource potential in the Member Countries and the importance of developing human resource capacity?

11.45-12.45

• Private Sector Perspective for Human Resource Capacity-Development

- Presentation: Ms. Rochelle TURNER
  Head of Research
  World Travel and Tourism Council (WTTC)

- Presentation: Mr. Hüseyin KÜÇÜ
  Human Resources Manager
  Rixos Hotels

Questions for Discussion

✓ There are several stakeholders in tourism workforce development. In enhancing human resource capacity, what can be possible role of private sector and NGOs or other development agencies?
✓ How can we encourage the private sector in tourism to identify skill needs and to plan human resource development in this regard?

12.45-14.00

Lunch

14.00-16.00

Success Stories of the Member States

- Discussion

16.00-16.15

Coffee Break

16.15-17.30

The Way Forward: Policy Options for Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce

- Moderation: Mr. Fatih ÜNLÜ
  Senior Expert
  COMCEC Coordination Office

Questions for Discussion

✓ Does your country have a long term national tourism human resource development strategy?
✓ Does your country have national occupational standards or accreditation in tourism services?
✓ What kind of education and training policies and programmes would you recommend to increase the quality of tourism workforce?
17.30-18.00  The Way Forward: Utilizing the New COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism

- Presentation: Mr. Mustafa TEKİN
  Director
  COMCEC Coordination Office

18.00-18.15  Closing Remarks
Annex 3: The Policy Recommendations

THE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS HIGHLIGHTED
BY THE 4TH MEETING OF THE TOURISM WORKING GROUP

Distinguished Members of the COMCEC Tourism Working Group,

The Tourism Working Group (TCWG) of the COMCEC has successfully held its 4th Meeting on September 4th, 2014 with the theme of “Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the Member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality” with the active participation of the Member Countries. During the Meeting, Tourism Working Group, made deliberations on the tourism workforce development in the Member Countries and discussed the policy options for enhancing the cooperation in this important field. The Analytical Study submitted to the TWG Meeting, the answers of the Member Countries to the policy questions as well as the capacity inventory questionnaire sent to the Member States by the COMCEC Coordination Office were the main inputs for the discussions. This document includes the policy options highlighted during the Meeting.

The Member States of the TWG are kindly invited to share their observations on the document to the COMCEC Coordination Office by October 15th, 2014. The comments received before October 15th, 2014 will be able to be incorporated into the Document. After incorporating the Member States’ contributions, this document will be submitted to the 30th Session of the COMCEC to be held on 25-28th November, 2014 as an outcome of the 4th TWG Meeting.

1- The Tourism Working Group underscored the importance of developing Tourism Workforce Development Strategies in the Member Countries and supporting the effective implementation of the existing ones.

Rationale: The Analytical Study specifically prepared for the 4th Meeting of the Tourism Working Group titled “Enhancing the Capacity of Tourism Workforce in the OIC member Countries for Improved Tourism Service Quality” highlighted the need to significantly invest in a tourism workforce development strategy as a means to strengthen and develop the tourism sector. Lack of long term Tourism Workforce Development Strategies is one of the challenges faced by the Member Countries. National Tourism Workforce Development Strategy can be an important tool to address the skills and labor shortages in the tourism and hospitality industry and to focus on priorities and resources for tourism development within the wider context of tourism sector. Moreover, availability of Tourism Workforce Development Strategy was one of the questions asked to the Member Countries in the Policy Questions circulated to the Member Countries by the COMCEC Coordination Office. In the responses of the Member Countries and their deliberations during the Working Group Meeting, the need for developing Tourism Workforce Development Strategies in the
Member Countries and supporting the effective implementation of the existing ones was highlighted.

**Instruments:**

- **COMCEC Tourism Working Group:** In its subsequent meetings, the COMCEC Working Group may elaborate the Tourism Workforce Development Strategies in a more detailed manner.

- **PCM:** Under the PCM mechanism, the COMCEC Coordination Office calls for project each year. With the PCM, the Member Countries participating in the Working Groups can submit projects to be financed through grants by the COMCEC Coordination Office. For enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce, the Member Countries can utilize the PCM mechanism and the CCO may finance the successful projects in this regard.

- **Capacity Building Activities:** In line with the COMCEC Coordination Office’s resources and the Member Countries own resources, some capacity building activities such as analytical studies, seminars, workshops, study visits, exchange of experts and training programs can be organized.

2- Enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce in the Member Countries

**Rationale:** Capacity building and technical assistance programs are important tools for enhancing tourism workforce capacity. In the analytical study, it was pointed out that effective capacity building and technical assistance programs will result in a better qualified/skilled tourism workforce. This issue was also highlighted by the Member Countries in their responses to the Policy Questions prepared by the COMCEC Coordination Office and deliberations during the WG Meeting.

**Instruments:**

- **PCM:** Under the PCM mechanism, the COMCEC Coordination Office calls for project each year. With the PCM, the Member Countries participating in the Working Groups can submit projects to be financed through grants by the COMCEC Coordination Office. For enhancing the capacity of tourism workforce, the Member Countries can utilize the PCM mechanism and the CCO may finance the successful projects in this regard.

- **Capacity Building Activities:** With the COMCEC Coordination Office’s resources and Member Countries’ own resources, some capacity building and technical assistance programs can be organized in the Member Countries. These programs may include organization of seminar, training programs, study visits, exchange of experts, workshops and preparation of analytical studies and training materials/documents, etc.
Annex 4: List of Participants

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS
OF THE 4th MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP
(September 4th, 2014, Ankara)

A. INVITED STATES

ARAB REPUBLIC OF EGYPT

- Ms. AMANY EL SHAZLY
  General Director, Ministry of Tourism

- Ms. HAGAR SOLIMAN
  Technical Member in International Relations Department,
  Ministry of Tourism

REPUBLIC OF INDONESIA

- Mr. ROBERTUS IRAWAN RIYANTO HADI
  Minister Counselor, Embassy of the Republic of Indonesia

- Ms. DYAH LESTARI ASMARANI
  First Secretary, Embassy of the Republic of Indonesia

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF IRAN

- Ms. FARAH VALINEJAD ARDEHAEI
  Tourism Expert, Iranian Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization

- Ms. ROSITA NASEROLMEMAR
  Expert, General Office of Cultural Heritage, Handicrafts and Tourism Organization

REPUBLIC OF IRAQ

- Mr. SAMEER AL-FURAIJI
  Director General, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities

- Mr. TALIB TUAMA
  Interpreter, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities
- Mr. BASIM AL-ELAYAWI
  Employee, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities

STATE OF KUWAIT

- Mr. FAHAD BAGER
  Ministry of Commerce and Industry
- Ms. MAJDA BAHBANAHAN
  Ministry of Commerce and Industry

LIBYA

- Mr. ALI OHAIDA
  Commercial Attaché, Libyan Embassy in Ankara

MALAYSIA

- Mr. SAAD KHAIRULNIZAM
  Principal Assistant Secretary,
  Ministry of Tourism and Culture Malaysia
- Mr. ZAINUL ABIDIN MUHAMAD FADHLI
  Principal Assistant Secretary,
  Ministry of Tourism and Culture Malaysia

REPUBLIC OF MOZAMBIQUE

- Mr. ZACARIAS SUMBANA
  Coordinator, Ministry of Tourism
- Mr. JOSE FARIA
  Head of Department Monitoring and Planning,
  Ministry of Tourism
- Mr. MAXWELL NAMITETE
  Senior Official of the Department of Cooperation,
  Ministry of Tourism

REPUBLIC OF NIGER

- Mr. ZATAOU KATO KARIDIO
  Ministry of Tourism
SULTANATE OF OMAN

- Mr. ALI AL-KHABURI
  Adviser, Financial & Managerial Development Affairs,
  Ministry of Tourism

- Ms. AMINA AL-BALUSHI
  Director of Statistics & Geographical Information,
  Ministry of Tourism

STATE OF PALESTINE

- Mr. AZMI ABU GHAZALEH
  Embassy of the State of Palestine in Ankara

KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

- Mr. SALAH ALBUKHAYYET
  Vice President, General Supervisor of the Initiative
  Tourism and Investment Development

- Mr. NAYEF ALMOTIRI
  Manager, Saudi Commission for Tourism & Antiquities

REPUBLIC OF SENEGAL

- Mr. MAMADOU BOYE BA
  Counsellor, Embassy of Senegal in Ankara

REPUBLIC OF SURINAME

- Mr. JAMES AKEWAJE
  Head of Department,
  Tourism Foundation Suriname

REPUBLIC OF TURKEY

- Mr. RAMAZAN BAHADIR ÇOKÇEVİK
  Head of Delegation, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Mr. MESUT ÖZBEK
  Head of Department, Ministry of Culture and Tourism
- Mr. ERKUT ATALAR
  Coordinator, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Ms. ESEN ÖZTÜRK
  Coordinator, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Ms. NERMİN ÖZKAN
  Department Chief, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Mr. MUSTAFA ÖZSOY
  Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Mr. ENİS UĞUR
  Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Ms. ÖZLEM AKKOYUNLU
  Assistant Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

- Mr. MERT KABASAKAL
  Assistant Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

B. INVITED INSTITUTIONS

ISLAMIC CENTRE FOR DEVELOPMENT OF TRADE (ICDT)

- Ms. KADIATOU DIALLO
  Head of Department at ICDT

STATISTICAL, ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RESEARCH AND TRAINING CENTER FOR ISLAMIC COUNTRIES (SESRIC)

- Mr. DAVRON ISHNAZAROV
  Research Assistant, Economic and Social Dept.

- Mr. ABDULHAMİT ÖZTÜRK
  Project Coordinator, Training and Technical Cooperation Dept.

TOURISM DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS

- Mr. THOMAS BAUM
  Professor and Head of Department, University of Strathclyde
WORLD TRAVEL AND TOURISM COUNCIL (WTTC)

- Ms. ROCHELLE TURNER
  Head of Research, World Travel & Tourism Council

RIXOS HOTELS

- Mr. HÜSEYİN KÜÇÜ
  Human Resources Manager, Rixos Hotels

C. COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE

- Mr. M. METİN EKER
  Director General, Head of COMCEC Coordination Office

- Mr. MUSTAFA TEKİN
  Head of Department

- Mr. SELÇUK KOÇ
  Head of Department

- Mr. FATİH ÜNLÜ
  Senior Expert

- Ms. AYLİN ŞENOL GÜN
  Expert, Drafting

- Ms. ASLI TAŞMAZ DADAKOĞLU
  Expert, Drafting

- Mr. MUSTAFA ADİL SAYAR
  Assistant Expert, Drafting

- Mr. OKAN POLAT
  Assistant Expert, Drafting

- Mr. MEHMET C. AKTAŞ
  Assistant Expert, Drafting

- Mr. ALİ ORUÇ
  Assistant Expert, Drafting

- Ms. HANDE ÖZDEMİR
  Coordinator of Registration Office
- Ms. EMİNE DEMİREL
  Coordinator of Documentation Center

- Mr. KEMAL ARSLAN
  Coordinator of Meeting Rooms

- Mr. ERCAN İBİK
  Coordinator of Transportation

- Ms. Z. LEYLA AŞK
  Social Program