



**Standing Committee
for Economic and Commercial Cooperation
of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (COMCEC)**

**Proceedings of the 19th Meeting of the
COMCEC Tourism Working Group**

**“Sustainable Human Resource Management in
Tourism Sector”**



COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE

October 2022

**Proceedings of the 19th Meeting of the
COMCEC Tourism Working Group**

“Sustainable Human Resource Management in Tourism Sector”
(October 5th, 2022, Virtual Meeting)

(2nd Session –Presentation of Final Draft of Research Report and Policy Formulation)

COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE
October 2022

For further information please contact:

Mrs. Ayten AKMAN KAÇAR
Senior Expert

COMCEC Coordination Office
Address: Necatibey Cad. No. 110/A
06100 Yüce-tepe
Ankara/TÜRKİYE

Phone : 90.312.2945710
Fax : 90.312.2945777
Web : www.comcec.org
E-mail : tourism@comcec.org

Table of CONTENTS

Introduction	5
1. Opening Session.....	5
2. Overview of the Report.....	5
3. Selected Case Studies- Indonesia, Malaysia, Tunisia, Azerbaijan, The Gambia, Türkiye and Maldives.....	6
4. Member Country Presentations	7
4.1. Uganda	7
5. Private Sectors'/ International Institutions' Contributions	7
5.1. World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC).....	7
5.2. TURSAB (ASSOCIATION of TURKISH TRAVEL AGENCIES).....	8
6. The COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism	8
7. Closing Remarks	9
Annex I LIST OF PARTICIPANTS.....	10
Annex II: Agenda of the Meeting.....	15
Annex III: Programme of the Meeting	16

Introduction

The Tourism Working Group (TWG) hold virtually its 19th Meeting on October 5th, 2022, with the theme of "Sustainable Human Resource Management in Tourism Sector".

The 19th meeting was attended by 19 Member States. The meeting was also attended by the representatives of the Statistical, Economic and Social Research and Training Centre for Islamic Countries (SESRIC), Islamic Center for Development of Trade (ICDT), Standards and Metrology Institute for Islamic Countries (SMIIC), International Trade Center (ITC), Islamic Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture (ICCIA) World Travel & Tourism Council(WTTC), Association of Turkish Travel Agencies (TÜRSAB) and COMCEC Coordination Office (CCO).

1. Opening Session

In line with the tradition of the Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC), the Meeting started with a recitation from the Holy Quran. At the outset, Mr. Selçuk KOÇ, Director General of the COMCEC made a brief opening speech about the latest developments in sustainable human resource management.

He mentioned the data of the United Nations World Tourism Organization, which advocates that every 10th employee globally is employed in the tourism sector (UNWTO highlights). Mr. KOÇ also expressed that tourism can be described as one of the key forces of the global and the EU economy, with approximately 2.3 million enterprises belonging to the sector creating 9.7 million jobs. He added that tourism is a multidimensional sector, which consists of different subsectors, where different and similar skills and competencies are required.

Mr. KOÇ also emphasized the fact that according to the latest UNWTO, most tourism professionals (61%) see better prospects for 2022. While 58% expect a rebound in 2022, mostly during the third quarter, 42% point to a potential rebound only in 2023. A majority of experts (64%) now expect international arrivals to return to 2019 levels only in 2024 or later, up from 45% in the September survey.

On the other hand, Mr. KOÇ expressed that as tourism is a service based industry where in the product is intangible in nature. One of the major factors that determine the success of a travel business is the human resource management.

Mr. Selçuk KOÇ, gave the floor to Mrs. Başak ÖNSAL DEMİR, (Multilateral Relations / Coordinator, Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Republic of Türkiye), Chairperson to the meeting. Welcoming the participants, Mrs. DEMİR briefly informed the attendees on the agenda and program of the meeting.

2. Overview of the Report

In the first session, Prof. Dr. Feride BAHAR IŞIN, Professor of Başkent University, Türkiye and Consultant to the COMCEC Tourism Working Group made a presentation on the general review of the research report with respect to the scope, conceptual framework and method of the study. In

the first part of the presentation, Prof. Dr. İŞİN give the background of the research and Prof. Dr. İŞİN stated that the report is expected to focus on mainly in these areas;

- a. Current Profile and Status of HR in Tourism
- b. Problems and Impacts of Covid-19 on Tourism Employment
- c. Human Resource Management Planning and Development in Tourism
- d. Sustainable Human Resource Policies for Tourism

Prof. Dr. İŞİN overview the importance of Tourism in the world and underlines the fact that tourism may constitute the substructure of a country, allows over employment, and provide an essential sense of cultural exchange. One of the keys to absolute success in the tourism sector is effective, efficient and proactive human resources management. Prof. Dr. İŞİN underlines that the study aims to ascertain the contribution of local employment and tourist education to the destinations' sustainable growth of tourism. While this study analyzes the human resources problems faced by countries in the tourism industry, it also aims to decide on the best human resources planning they offer as a solution.

Prof. Dr. İŞİN underlines the importance of human resource management constituting the core capability. According to her, sustainable human resources policies in the tourism should be planned as short, medium and long term. In the short term, it is necessary to develop strategies for the destruction caused by the global epidemic. Medium and long-term strategies should be planned by prioritizing cultural awareness and industry 4.0.

3. Selected Case Studies- Indonesia, Malaysia, Tunisia, Azerbaijan, The Gambia, Türkiye and Maldives

In the second session, Prof. Dr. İŞİN expressed that the research report is expected to have case studies and she made a presentation about Indonesia, Malaysia, Tunisia, Azerbaijan, The Gambia, Türkiye and Maldives. She underlines that the tourism industry is an important part of Indonesia's economy, so Indonesia should focus on sustainable human resource management by adjusting to the new global order, advancing technologies and customer expectation, in-service training. Prof. Dr. İŞİN explained that In Malaysia example, Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) is very important, as GHRM is to create an ecologically vivacious life attitude. Workplaces can achieve goals and plans by connecting recruitment, selection, training, performance appraisals, organizational culture team, work and training.

In Tunisia case, Human Resource Information System (HRIS) project helps to increase productivity, capacity for innovation and better services. Employee capacity for innovation and a more comfortable working environment and techniques is essential for Tunisian human resource management.

Prof. Dr. İŞİN emphasized that Sustainable human resource management is very crucial in Azerbaijan's tourism sector. In order to increase tourism value and income, it is vital to invest in qualified personnel to improve expertise in the tourism industry. Planned tourism-related propaganda among the local population is vital, as it will help the local residents be aware of the areas potential. In addition, it is advisable for Azerbaijan to support small and medium-sized firms and build enabling environments for them. To raise the level of service, technical support such as participation in staff development programs, seminars, etc. can be organized.

In the Gambia; educated, licenced and certified employees in tourism sector is vital to manage the tourism industry efficiently. Increasing the security in tourism, can also help to accelerate tourism income.

Regarding Türkiye case, Prof. Dr. İŞİN expressed that education, which is emphasized to be important from experience, creates the quality in the tourism industry. Therefore, it is not the experience of the tourism workers, but the tourism education they receive that matters and local staff is more efficient as, local staff is more familiar with the country and their own tourism industry, providing a better quality of service. The difficult conditions created by COVID-19 caused employees to leave their jobs, post-pandemic organizations created a new working environment and caused them to adapt to the new world order. For this reason, it is vital that the industry needs new regulations and new human resources management rules. Employee training and certification are important for service quality, as the employee is satisfied, a good service will be provided and the customer will be more satisfied.

In the assessment related to Maldives, Prof. Dr. İŞİN indicated that local's employment in tourism sector should be encouraged. Local, independent self- sufficient workforce will motive formalization and be institutionalized in tourism sector. Maldives should pay attention population issues, education, training and information.

4. Member Country Presentations

4.1. Uganda

Commissioner Tourism Development of Uganda delegate, Ms. Rosemary KOBUTAGI made a presentation relating Uganda's practices in human resource management of tourism sector. Ms. KOBUTAGI first gave information about Uganda's tourism system. Ms. KOBUTAGI stated that the Uganda's HRM practices in tourism focus on; recruiting, retraining and retaining. Human resource development in the sector is a joint effort between the government and several development partners such as UNDP and OIC.

Ms. KOBUTAGI also emphasized that despite the trainings, the sector still faces; lack of motivation from the workforce due to the low wages earned making them venture into other fields. In Uganda Hotel and Tourism Training Institute (UHTTI)'s report, over 13% of their graduates end up in other fields. Despite the trainings, the sector still faces; poor service delivery, poor trainers, inadequacy in skills, lack of training equipment in most institutions, substandard equipment in the institutions that have lack of exposure to new best practices and technology.

5. Private Sectors' / International Institutions' Contributions

5.1. World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC)

The representatives of the WTTC, Nejc JUS Head of Research made a consecutive presentation about this issue. Mr. JUS highlighted that how staff shortages affected the Tourism & Travel (T&T) sector;

- With the easing of restrictions, employment demand is starting to outstrip the available supply
- Travel & Tourism businesses are struggling to fill vacancies
- During COVID-19, T&T employees have moved into other sectors or out of the labour

force

- As demand for travel returns, a sufficient labour force is required to fill vacancies and enable the sector to recover
- Hence the critical need to proactively address the current issue of staff shortages

Lastly, Mr. JUS also proposed some policy recommendations on staff shortages, such as; facilitating labour mobility, facilitating flexible and remote work, enabling decent work and providing competitive employee benefits, developing and supporting a skilled workforce, promoting opportunities within the sector, strengthening collaboration at all levels and adopting technological and digital solutions.

5.2. TURSAB (ASSOCIATION of TURKISH TRAVEL AGENCIES)

The representatives of the TURSAB, Mr. Hasan EKER, Board Member, made a concrete presentation about tourism employment. According this presentation, tourism industry had a loss of 18.6 percent in world tourism employment in 2020 and 62 million people lost their jobs. While 333 million people were employed in tourism in 2019, it decreased to 271 million people in 2020. In 2021; there was an increase of 6.7 percent in tourism employment. 18.2 million people participated in tourism employment. However, the numbers are still far behind in 2019.

Mr. EKER continued his presentation by providing TURSAB's suggestions in sustainable human resource management. Increasing personnel income according to other sector will help motivate the staff, overtime working fees must be paid regularly and follow clearly in order to keep the staff happy. Also, tourism industry must be attractive profession for the staff so, the personnel will continue in the industry after education and will not change his/her sector. Defining tourism as a profession and providing development in this field will provide social status to the employee. Last but not least, defining job description clearly will provide inner peace and work environment peace and will increase success.

6. The COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism

Mr. Kadir ALTINTOP, Program Coordinator at COMCEC Coordination Office, made a presentation on utilizing the COMCEC Project Funding Mechanism (CPF).

Mr. ALTINTOP informed the participants about the essentials of the COMCEC Project Funding. Mr. ALTINTOP continued his presentation by highlighting the timeline and budget limits for the project submission. He stressed the importance of finding a project idea and informed the participants on how they can find project topics. He also explained the main project types along and criteria for being an applicant for a project. He also reminded the participants to read the application documents particularly the Project Preparation and Submission Guidelines as well as supported sectoral themes before designing and submitting their project proposal.

Mr. ALTINTOP finally informed the participants about other two grant programs, namely COMCEC Al-Quds Program and COMCEC Covid Response Program.

7. Closing Remarks

The Meeting ended with closing remarks of Mrs. Bařak ÖNSAL DEMİR, Multilateral Relations / Coordinator, Ministry of Culture and Tourism, Republic of Türkiye and Mr. Can AYGÜL, Head of Department at the COMCEC Coordination Office.

In his closing remarks, Mrs. DEMİR conveyed his appreciations to all the presenters and participants for the fruitful deliberations made during the meeting. Then, she informed the participants that the policy recommendations formulated in the 19th Meeting of the COMCEC Tourism Working Group will be submitted to the COMCEC Ministerial Session that will be held in 26th-29th November, 2022.

Afterwards, in his closing remarks, Mr. AYGÜL expressed his thanks and appreciation to all participants for their contributions to the discussions throughout the meeting.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks.

Annex I LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

A.MEMBER COUNTRIES OF THE OIC

ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF AFGHANISTAN

-Mr. ALI AHMAD SAADAT

Director General Regional Cooperation and Provincial Affairs Coordination, Ministry of Economy

REPUBLIC OF ALBANIA

-Mr. EMANUELA TUMANI

Specialist, Ministry of Tourism and Environment

REPUBLIC OF AZERBAIJAN

-Mr. HUSEYN MAMMADOV

Director of Department, Azerbaijan Tourism Board

-Mr. MİR KANAN MANSURZADA

Coordinator of Destination Management Organizations, Azerbaijan Tourism Board

-Mr. AZER ORUCOV

Senior Consultant, State Tourism Agency

BURKINA FASO

-Mr. MAMOUDOU OUEDRAOGO

Tourism Executive Officer, Ministry of Culture, and Tourism

-Mr. SOME EMMANUEL

Legal Adviser, Ministry of Culture, and Tourism

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

-Mr. NDRIGERMAIN APHINGKOUASSI

Executive Secretary of the National Tourism Council

ARAB REPUBLIC OF EGYPT

-Mr. ADEL ELGENDY

Director of the Strategic Management Department, Ministry of Tourism & Antiquities

-Ms. NASHWA TALAAT

Advisor to Minister of Tourism and Antiquities for Sustainable Tourism, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities

-Ms. SOHEÏR MUSTAFA

Senior Tourist Specialist, Ministry of Tourism and Antiquities

REPUBLIC OF IRAQ

-Mr. JABBAR ALGHURAIBAWI

General Director, Tourism Board

HASHEMITE KINGDOM OF JORDAN

-Mr. NADÏA QUDAH

Director of Cooperation and International Cooperation, Ministry Of Tourism and Antiquities

MALAYSIA

-Mr. JAYAPPRAGAS MUTHUVEEROO

Senior Principal Assistant Director, Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture Malaysia

-Mr. LÏONEL HARÏTH SEBASTÏAN DARAUP

Assistant Director, Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture Malaysia

-Ms. FAREEDA MOHD

Officer, Ministry of Tourism, Arts and Culture

REPUBLIC OF MOZAMBIQUE

-Ms. NATIVIDADE JOSE CHICHAVA

Head of Multilateral Department, Ministry Of Culture and Tourism

THE STATE OF PALESTINE

-Ms. EMAN ALTÏTÏ

Director of Department Of Antiquities & Cultural Heritage, Ministry Of Tourism and Antiquities

STATE OF QATAR

-Mr. SARA ABUALAININ

HR Researcher, Qatar Tourism

KINGDOM OF SAUDI ARABIA

-Mr. QASIM ALALAWI

Senior specialist, GAFT

-Mr. WALEED ALDAKHIL

International Organizations Specialist, the Saudi General Authority of Foreign Trade

REPUBLIC OF SENEGAL

-Mr. PHILIPPE NDIAGA BA NDIAGA

Director In Charge Of Tourist Promotion, Ministry Of Tourism and Leisure

REPUBLIC OF SIERRA LEONE

-Mr. CLAUDE FATORMA BUNDU SAMA

Senior Tourist Guide, Ministry of Tourism and Cultural Affairs

TÜRKİYE CUMHURİYETİ

-Ms. BASAK ONSALDEMİR

Multilateral Relations Coordinator, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

-Mr. FARUK ÇUBUKÇU

Culture and Tourism Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

-Mr. SERKAN KILIÇ

Culture and Tourism Expert, Ministry of Culture and Tourism (General Directorate of Research and Training)

-Ms. BANU BEDEL

Chief Inspector, Ministry of Culture and Tourism

-Ms. MELEK GULER

Translator, the Ministry of Culture and Tourism of the Republic of Türkiye

REPUBLIC OF UGANDA

-Mr. DAVIDS HALONGO

Conservator, Ministry of Tourism Wildlife and Antiquities

B.THE OIC GENERAL SECRETARIAT

OIC

-Mr. TARABZOUNI ALBARAA

Professional Officer, OIC

C.THE OIC SUBSIDIARY ORGANS

**STATISTICAL, ECONOMIC, SOCIAL RESEARCH AND TRAINING CENTER FOR
ISLAMIC COUNTRIES (SESRIC)**

-Mr. DAVRON ISHNAZAROV

Researcher, SESRIC

-Mr. SYED TAHIR MAHMUD

Researcher, SESRIC

-Mr. THIerno ALIOU BALDE

Assistant Project Officer, SESRIC

D.AFFILIATED ORGANS OF THE OIC

ISLAMIC CHAMBER OF COMMERCE, INDUSTRY AND AGRICULTURE (ICCIA)

-Mr. MOHAMMED QASEM

Chairman (Sector Skills Council Tourism & Hospitality), Sector Skills Council (Tourism & Hospitality)

STANDARDS AND METROLOGY INSTITUTE FOR ISLAMIC COUNTRIES (SMIIC)

-Mr. EMEL GÖNÇ

Assistant Expert, SMIIC

E.OIC STANDING COMMITTEES

INTERNATIONAL TRADE CENTER (ITC)

-Ms. NUR ALYSSA CORALINE YUSSIN

Director, Research & Training, Islamic Tourism Centre

F. INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

WORLD TRAVEL AND TOURISM COUNCIL

-Mr. NEJC JUS

Head of Research, World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC)

ASSOCIATION OF TURKISH TRAVEL AGENCIES (TÜRSAB)

-Mr. HASAN EKER

Board Member, Association of Turkish Travel Agencies (TÜRSAB)

G.COMCEC COORDINATION OFFICE

-Mr. SELÇUK KOÇ

Deputy Director General, COMCEC Coordination Office

-Mr. CAN AYGÜL

Head of Department, COMCEC Coordination Office

-Mr. MEHMET ASLAN

Head of Department, COMCEC Coordination Office

-Mr. MEHMET CELALETTİN AKTAŞ

Head of Department, COMCEC Coordination Office

-Ms. AYTEN AKMAN KAÇAR

Expert

-Ms. EDA AKÇA

Expert, COMCEC Coordination Office

-Prof. Dr. FERİDE BAHAR İŞİN

Consultant, CCO

Annex II: Agenda of the Meeting



DRAFT AGENDA OF THE 19TH MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP

(October 5th, 2022; Virtual Meeting)*

“SUSTAINABLE HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN TOURISM SECTOR”

(2st Session- Discussion and Review of the Final Report)

Opening

1. Sustainable Human Resource Management in Tourism Sector in the World and the OIC Member Countries: Scope, Conceptual Framework and Methodology
2. Preliminary Findings of the Selected Case Country Analysis and the Lessons Learnt
3. Experiences/Perspectives of the Member States, International Institutions and NGOs to the Sustainable Human Resource Management in Tourism
4. COMCEC Financial Support Program

Closing

.....
.....

** The invitation link will be communicated to the registered participants of the COMCEC Tourism Working Group ahead of the Meeting.*

Annex III: Programme of the Meeting



DRAFT PROGRAMME

19TH MEETING OF THE COMCEC TOURISM WORKING GROUP (October 5th, 2022, Virtual Meeting)

“SUSTAINABLE HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN TOURISM SECTOR”

October 5th, 2022

- 13.15 – 13.30 Joining the Online Meeting**
(The link for the participation will be conveyed in advance of the Meeting)
- 13.30 - 13.40 Opening**
- 13.40 – 14.00 Presentation of the Research Report**
*Presentation: Professor Feride Bahar IŞIN,
Consultant, Bařkent University*
- 14.00 - 14.10 Questions and Answers**
- 14.10 – 14.30 Selected Case Countries Presentation**
*Presentation: Professor Feride Bahar IŞIN,
Consultant, Bařkent University*
- 14.30 - 14.40 Questions and Answers**
- 14.40 - 15.10 Member Country Experiences**
Questions and Answers
- 15.10 – 15.25 Contributions of International Institutions / Private Sector**
*World Travel and Tourism Council
Presentation: Nejc JUS
Head of Research
WTTC*
Questions and Answers

15.25- 15.40 Association of Turkish Travel Agencies
Presentation: Hasan EKER
Board Member
Questions and Answers

15.40 – 16.10 Moderated Policy Debate Session on Sustainable Human Resource Management in Tourism Sector

15.40-15.45 -Presentation by COMCEC Coordination Office
Ms. Ayten AKMAN KAÇAR
Expert

15.45-16.10 -Moderation by Başak ÖNSAL
Head of Department
Republic of Türkiye Ministry of Culture and Tourism

16.10 – 16.30 COMCEC Project Support Programs
COMCEC Coordination Office
Questions and Answers

16.30 – 16.40 Closing Remarks